

<b>X</b> Full Publication	Partial publication	Not for publication
---------------------------------	------------------------	------------------------

<b>QUEENS CROSS HOUSING ASSOCIATION</b>		<b>25 FEBRUARY 2020</b>
<b>BOARD MEETING</b>		<b>FOR APPROVAL/DISCUSSION ITEM NO. 8</b>
<b>Update on Roof Collapse at 21 Murano Place on 29 January 2020</b>		
<b>Executive Lead</b>	Director of Property, Enterprise & Regeneration	
<b>Lead Officer/Author</b>	Head of Property Services	
<b>Action Required</b>	To review the contents and agree on additional monitoring and procurement for permanent roof repairs.	
<b>Key Points</b>	<p>Roof collapse occurred on Wed 29 January 2020, requiring our tenants to be evacuated from homes for approx. one week.</p> <p>Temporary roof repairs have been carried out, and remedial internal works were completed as quickly as possible. An engineer has been engaged to advise on a permanent solution, considering also an adjacent block with a similar roof design. A procurement exercise will be required to design and install the new roof.</p> <p>It is planned that this work can be undertaken with residents in-situ.</p>	
<b>Timing</b>	3 to 6 months for procurement of permanent roof repairs.	
<b>Financial Implications</b>	<p>The Association's losses are covered by our Building Insurance Policy, thus the costs incurred in addressing the collapse and the reinstatement of the building will be covered by our insurance following payment of our excess of £5,000.</p> <p>Preventative works to 19 Murano, not covered by Insurance cover, in the region of £5,000.</p> <p>Goodwill gesture of £200 per property. Total of £2,000.</p>	
<b>Engagement</b>	Throughout the incident there has been regular engagement with affected tenants both face-to-face and in writing. Staff have provided a regular re-assuring presence on site. Following Board discussion and development of proposals for remedial works, we plan further engagement on the next steps.	
<b>Equality, Diversity, Inclusion</b>	No EDI implications.	
<b>Risk</b>	Reputation Risk: Media coverage of the incident has already occurred, so risk for further coverage.	
<b>Contribution to QCHA strategy</b>	The report details our response to a significant incident and supports the Association strategic objective.	

## 1. RECOMMENDATION

1.1 The Board should note the content of this report and consider the following:

- a) Approve the recommendations for increased inspections at 19 & 21 Murano Place
- b) To carry out a procurement exercise for permanent roof structure

1.2 This report is classified for full publication.

## 2. BACKGROUND

2.1 This report will provide an overview of the incident that occurred on Wednesday 29 January 2020 at 21 Murano Place, a 5 storey new-build block with 10 flats, all owned by the association.

2.2 21 Murano Place is the left hand close of a single building (2 closes) consisting of 21 & 19 Murano Place, and was purchased along with 45 Murano Street in 2006 from a developer, Kenmore Property. These properties were built by AB Hamilton on behalf of Kenmore Property. Neither are currently trading. The buildings were purchased upon their completion. The Association had no involvement during its construction. Certificate of Completion was issued by Glasgow City Council for 21 Murano Place on 2 June 2006.

2.3 A summary of the initial incident and our emergency response, including the initial findings of our structural engineer, is listed in chronological order within Appendix 1.

2.4 Within the flats, the level of damage caused by the water ingress was mainly in relation to staining to ceilings, with one ceiling requiring to be replaced within a kitchen. Water damage was also caused to an oven and hob, a kitchen base unit and to some flooring. All remedial works required to be undertaken by the Association, have now been completed within the flats.

2.5 Within the close, landing ceilings have been replaced with plaster repairs and decoration completed. The lift remains out of service due to damage to an electronic sensor, which had to be ordered. It is anticipated that the lift should be operational week commencing 24<sup>th</sup> February.

2.6 Further to the initial inspections to the roof void space, additional inspections have been carried out by our engineer, DCF Design Consultants, at 19 Murano Place and although this has not identified any defects, additional strengthening in the roof void and the introduction of an overflow within the gutter has been recommended.

2.7 A further inspection took place at 45 Murano St, which has a different roof design, with no issues noted.

2.8 Given the initial findings by the engineer, the gutters at 19 and 21 Murano Place were cleaned on 6<sup>th</sup> February 2020.

2.9 The remaining Murano Crescent development will also be cleaned as part of the gutter cleaning programme over the next few months. These properties, however, have a different roof detail, that includes a pitched roof above the close area rather than a flat roof parapet, thus would not experience the same issue as 21 Murano Place.

2.10 On checking recent historical repairs for the building, the previous gutter clean at 21 Murano Place was completed on 28<sup>th</sup> February 2019 as part of the Associations annual gutter cleaning programme.

2.11 A roof repair on 19 Murano Place was also completed on 21<sup>st</sup> October 2019. This instructed repair was initially to the main roof covering above Flat 4/1. This work was then varied to include for pumping water out of the close roof area, following notification by our maintenance contractor that the gutter was full of water. Our contractor has confirmed that their work was localised to 19 Murano Place only.

### **3. PROPOSAL**

3.1 Following the temporary repairs already undertaken, a procurement exercise will be required to select a contractor to carry out the installation of a permanent solution involving the roof structure, gulley overflow, additional roof supports and the formation of a hatch at 21 Murano Place. Given the similar roof design at 19 Murano Place, it is proposed that the same solution be installed in this block.

3.2 It is proposed that in addition to the annual gutter clean that a 6 monthly inspection is carried out at 19 & 21 Murano Place. The proposed new hatch within the roof void above the existing roof will facilitate ease access for inspections as the current design only allows for hoist access.

3.3 Weekly inspections will also be carried out to monitor the condition of the temporary construction within the roof void, until the appointed contractor is on site to complete the permanent roof structure.

### **4. TIMING**

4.1 Following a formal written report with permanent repairs from our structural engineer, a project team will be set up to initiate and conclude the permanent roof structure at 21 Murano Place and the improvements at 19 Murano Place.

4.2 It is anticipated that these works should be completed by June 2020.

### **5. RESOURCE & MONITORING**

5.1 There will be no additional resource required to monitor the additional inspections to both the temporary (weekly) and permanent (6 monthly) inspections. These will be carried out by the Maintenance Officers covering this area.

5.2 Current resources within the Investment Team will be utilised to procure an appropriate contractor for the main recommendations.

### **6. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS**

6.1 The cost of the remedial works and temporary roof structure is estimated at approximately £25,000 and is subject to a building insurance claim, thus will require the Association to pay our excess of £5,000. It is estimated that temporary accommodation and additional expenses costs, also covered by our insurance policy will be in the region of £9,000.

6.2 The permanent roof structure works will be procured to ensure the Association obtain best value for money, and is estimated to be £30,000, and will also be covered within our insurance claim.

6.3

Works recommended within 19 Murano Place is however not covered by our insurance policy, as these are proactive and preventative measures. It is anticipated that these costs will be in the region of £5,000. As there are owners within this block, we will require to raise the issue of their financial contribution to these works with them.

6.4

Given the obvious upset and stress caused to tenants by the roof collapse, the Association is proposing that a goodwill payment should be made to each of the affected households, in the sum of £200. Whilst all of the decant costs and expenses incurred by tenants have been paid by the Association, and will form part of our insurance claim, this goodwill payment is voluntary and cannot be reclaimed via insurance

## **7. ENGAGEMENT**

7.1 Throughout this incident, there has been regular engagement with affected tenants both face-to-face and in writing. Staff from our Neighbourhood and Property Services have provided a regular re-assuring presence on site. There have been regular visits to the affected properties to advise of the temporary works to the roof and agreeing internal work to the flats, and there will also be final post inspections of all work completed.

7.2 Whilst it is envisaged that the permanent roof solution can be installed with tenant's in-situ, it is paramount that residents within 21 Murano Place are kept informed of the proposals and timing of the permanent works and given time to prepare for the potential further disruption. A further meeting is planned for early March.

7.3 We will plan our engagement with the tenants and owners at 19 Murano Place to follow closely behind, to allow time to fully explain the implications for them.

7.4 This incident was also advised to the Scottish Housing Regulator as a Notifiable Event.

## **8. EQUALITY, DIVERSITY, INCLUSION**

8.1 No EDI implications.

## **9. RISK ASSESSMENT**

9.1 Weekly inspections will be carried out to ensure the ongoing integrity of the existing temporary support.

9.2 There would be reputational damage should there be an occurrence of this type of incident in the future. DCF Structural Engineers will be involved in the procurement of the permanent roof to ensure a more robust roof structure is in place. With the additional roof inspections, this will reduce the risk of the build-up of water.

## **Appendix 1 Incident Events in Chronological Order**

### Wednesday 29 January 2020

Initially, a call was taken at 16:43 from a tenant advising that the lights within the close had gone out. An emergency Works Order was raised, and our contractor requested to attend. A call was then taken at 16:53 from the tenant advising that something has 'exploded' in the close and that water was getting into all flats. An emergency Works Order was raised, and our contractor requested to attend.

Around 5pm, following notification that Scottish Fire & Rescue were in attendance at 21 Murano Place, and tenants were out in the street, several members of staff, along with our maintenance contractor attended the site to evaluate the situation.

Given the weather conditions, all tenants were invited to the main office, where tea/coffee and biscuits were provided.

The initial investigation indicated that the flat roof directly above the close area had collapsed, and a volume of water that had gathered on the roof had flowed out of the roof void via the small hatch in the close ceiling as well as the via a section of the inner leaf of the rear external wall.

Given the volume of water that had flowed through the close and into the 10 flats within the close, it was quickly established that properties would not be habitable. Around 6.45pm, alternative accommodation was sourced, and discussed with the tenants.

Tenants were given the option of an escorted visit to their flat to collect any items they required, including clothes or medicine.

Tenants who were not in the office were called to inform them of the situation and the accommodation arranged. Tenants were also advised to keep any receipts, as Queens Cross would cover any reasonable costs (food, etc) up to £25 per person. Tenants who required accommodation were checked into a local hotel by 7.30pm.

Our contractor worked until 7.30pm to make safe the roof, and to ensure that the front and rear close doors were made secure. After this, the area was patrolled, on a staggered basis, every 20 – 40 minutes, by our caretakers until the office opened.

During this time, the loft space within 19 Murano Place was also checked, and found to be dry.

Our insurance company was notified at this time, and arrangements for a loss adjustor to visit on Thursday.

### Thursday 30 January 2020

A site inspection was carried out at 10am by local Civil Engineers, DCF Design Consultants, to establish the cause of the roof collapse and to ascertain remedial works required.

Our engineer verbally confirmed that the roof collapse was due to a blocked gulley that had caused water to build up within the roof, which then caused the roof timbers to fail and a section of the roof structure and coverings to fall onto the concrete slab. This collapse also caused sections of the walls to move allowing water to flow down the inner rear common wall.

The engineer recommended additional fixings, straps and internal partition walls be introduced, as well as an overflow within the gully to ensure that current building regulation requirements are met.

Due to the volume of water within the close, Scottish Power disconnected all power to the close and advised that they would only be able to re-energise the close once appropriate certification could be provided for all flats to indicate that they were safe.

A site visit was undertaken with our loss adjustor, to allow them to see first-hand the level of damage and to approve the remedial works being carried out.

Our maintenance contractor continued with their temporary repairs, re-constructing the roof structure and coverings, including the additional temporary supports requested by the engineer.

#### Friday 31 January 2020

Due to faults recorded within the electrical circuits within the flats, obtaining the required certification for Scottish Power was not possible.

In order to assist with drying out of the flats, a temporary limited landlord's supply was negotiated with Scottish Power. This allowed industrial gas blowers to be brought to site.

#### Saturday 1 February 2020

Additional gas blowers were brought to site to allow a blower to be located at the entrance of every flat, as well as the common close. These blowers were only operational during the working day, as they were required to be monitored, for health and safety reasons.

#### Sunday 2 February 2020

Electrical safety inspections commenced on Sunday morning, by electricians from our maintenance contractor as well as our in-house electrician. Only a few flats were inspected, and could only be certified safe following the disconnection of light circuits.

#### Monday 3 February 2020

Electrical safety inspections continued on Monday, with additional electricians brought on site. All inspections were completed by 5.30pm.

#### Tuesday 4 February 2020

Following the completion of all relevant paperwork, Scottish Power was contacted and was able to re-energise the close by 11am, allowing further electrical and gas checks to be carried out. Tenants were then allowed back into their properties in a staged manner, starting with tenants in the top floor, around 3pm, with all tenants in their homes by 5.20pm, except one household who had elected to stay another night in the hotel.